Welcome to the CERES & ClimeFish Policy Session with EC & REA Online conference Thursday 11<sup>th</sup> of June at 10.00 CEST

Advice for the meeting:

- Please, mute your microphone
- Turn off your video after you presented yourself
- Use the chat function for questions and comments (and don't raise hand)



# Welcome to the CERES & ClimeFish Policy Session with EC & REA Agenda:

- 10.00-10.05 Sign-in, switch off your camera and mute your microphone after you say hello
- 10.05-10.20 Welcome and goals for the meeting (Zampoukas, DG RTD)
- 10.20-10.40 Marine aquaculture (Aschan, Papandroulakis, Peck)
- 10.40-11.00 Freshwater (Peck, Aschan)
- 11.00-11.10 Stretch your legs and fetch a coffee
- 11.10-11.30 Marine fisheries (Aschan, Peck)
- 11:30-11:40 General conclusions and advice (Peck, Aschan)
- 11.40-11.50 Arctic impact on weather and climate, Blue-Action, (Payne, DTU)
- 11.50-12.00 Closing remarks (Zampoukas, DG RTD)

#### **Policy Session:**

### BG-02-2015 - Forecasting and anticipating effects of climate change on fisheries & aquaculture



Co-creating a decision support framework to ensure sustainable fish production in Europe under climate change

> April 2016 21 partners





Prof. Michaela Aschan UiT The Arctic University of Norway

European Commission – Online 11<sup>th</sup> June 2020





# **Two IPCC Scenarios (RCP4.5 and RCP8.5)**



FRFS

Representative Concentration Pathway: Carbon Emissions













# CERES Storylines (ceresproject.eu)





#1 Rainbow trout in north-east Europe



#2 Rainbow trout in the eastern Mediterranean



#3 Carp in northeast Europe



#4 Pike-perch in south-east Europe



#5 Mussels in the North Sea



#6 Oysters in the North Sea



#7 Mussels in the

Atlantic coast



#8 Oysters and clams in the Atlantic coast



#9 Mussels in the Mediterranean



#10 Salmon in the north-east Atlantic

north-east Atlantic

#11 Meagre at the

Atlantic coast



#12 Seabass and seabreem in West Med and European south Atlantic



#13 Seabass and seabreem in the eastern Mediterranean



#14 Herring, capelin, and cod in the Barents and Norwegian Seas





#16 Herring in the North Sea



#17 Gadoids in the North Sea



#18 Mackerel in the #19 Flatfish in the North Sea and north-east Atlantic



#20 Dolphinfish in the north-west Mediterranean



#21 Sardines and anchovies in the Bay of Biscay



#22 Sardines and anchovies in the north-west Mediterranean



#23 Hake in the

Aegean Sea and

Mediterreanean

eastern

#15 Herring, sprat

and cod in the

**Baltic Sea** 



#24 Bluefin Tuna in the north-west Mediterranean

Physics / biogeochemistry -----> Ecology -----> Economics -----> Sociology

### CERES Storylines (ceresproject.eu)







# **ClimeFish Case Studies in 3 sectors**



European Union's tion under grant



# Seafood Sectors and ClimeFish Case Studies

<u>Fisheries</u>	Lakes and Ponds	<u>Aquaculture</u>
Northeast Atlantic Pelagic Fisheries	Hungarian Pond Production	Northeast Atlantic: Marine Aquaculture
West of Scotland: Demersal fisheries	Lake Garda Fisheries	Greece: Marine Aquaculture
		Shellfish production in Galicia





# ClimeFish Decision Support Framework developed with stakeholders



# ClimeFish Decision Support Framework developed with stakeholders



# What was included in ClimeFish models?



ClimeFish



# Aquaculture





# Greek marine aquaculture is a growing sector

- Stands for more than 63% of national fish production
- 63 companies run 318 finfish farms
- European sea bass and gilthead seabream important

# ClimeFish studied CC effects

• European sea bass and meagre (emerging)







# Effects at the individual level RCP8.5 E. seabass, 800 g

Change in days to reach harvest size

- 2030: no negative effect
- 2050: positive effect



Effect of husbandry on growth is higher than that of temperature and wind velocity





# Effects at the individual level RCP8.5

# Change in days to reach harvest size

- 2030: no negative effect
- 2050: positive effect



E. seabass, 800 g

Effect of husbandry on growth is higher than that of temperature and wind velocity

# Effect at the farm level

Extreme events

ClimeFish

- higher mortality rates
- negative effect on biomass productio





# Shared Impacts of CC across Aquaculture CS

Hungarian Ponds, North Atlantic Salmon, Mediterranean Seabass, Iberian Upwelling Shelfish

Growth/size variabilty and mortality	Escapees, predation and HABs	Suboptimal conditions	Suitability of sites	Changes in productivity
Growth rates and yields	Increased Escapees / Detachment	Increased fouling	Change site productivity	Changes in production capacity
Increased size variability	Increased predation	Anoxic conditions	Conflicts of space	Changes in feed
Changes to growing season	HABs and jellyfish blooms	Accessibility and human safety issues	and farm allocation	conversion rates
Increased mortality	Occurrence of pathogens	Infrastructure deterioration	Harvesting closures	Increased production costs
Climerisn			nonzon zozo research and inn agreement no. 677039	ovation action under grant

### A Decision Support Software

Aquaculture in Greece



 $\times$ 

Risk assessment Adaptation measures

### **Stakeholders have a say!**

2 stakeholder meetings: Athens, April 2018, June 2019



In total 24 adaptation measures/ actions identified on 4 levels Contribution to a sectoral Adaptation Plan

- Technical/ Industry
- Research and knowledge building
- Policy and Regulation
- Funding

# Towards a national Climate Adaptation Plan

Industry

 increase collaboration between farms in a wider organizational level (zones of development)

• Research community

 understand the biological mechanisms implicated in response to various climate change drivers

- Administration
  - establish a flexible legal framework for the operation of the farms and designation of new sites
  - $\,\circ\,$  support research and innovation

# Estratexia Galega de Cambio Climático e Enerxía 2050

galicia

#### 6.2.3.2.-Vulnerabilidade e risco do sector pesqueiro en Galicia

En Galicia, a pesca considérase un sector característico da economía galega por ser fonte de ingresos, subministro de alimentos e actividade dinamizadora do mercado laboral. Segundo o Instituto Galego de Estatística (IGE), no ano 2015, o sector da pesca supuxo **un 1,9% do PIB** de Galicia, empregou a 33.503 persoas e un VAB de 1.097.577€.

Segundo os últimos rexistros nas lonxas galegas a especie máis capturada en 2017 foi a xarda pintada, cun 27,5% do total de capturas, seguida da merluza (16,5%), o xurelo (14,4%) e o lirio (12,3%).

Actualmente, a importancia da repercusión do cambio climático sobre o comportamento e a distribución das especies mariñas de maior interese comercial está a ser analizada no marco do proxecto europeo Climefish. España e Portugal tamén traballan conxuntamente no proxecto MarRisk para analizar e monitorar a evolución do clima litoral, así como impulsar a resiliencia dos sectores económicos estratéxicos da costa galega, como é o caso da explotación do mexillón.





XUNTA DE GALICIA



# Implementation of advice on EU level:

ClimeFish provided recommendations for the new "Strategic guidelines for sustainable development of EU aquaculture" at Aquaculture Technical Seminar with the MS in Brussels 10<sup>th</sup> of October 2020.

- This event was organized by DG Mare
- Advice on how to include climate change adaptation into the Multi Annual Plans for Aquaculture in Member States and how the new knowledge can be utilized







### **Top-value species to European Aquaculture Examined**

Salmon Trout Salmo salar **Oncorhynchus mykiss** Carp Sea bass Cyprinus carpio Dicentrarchus labrax Sea bream **Blue mussel** Sparus aurata Mytilus edulis **Cupped oyster Mediterranean mussel** Crassostrea gigas Mytilus galloprovincialis European clam Ruditapes decussatus

https://ec.europa.eu/fisheries/cfp/aquaculture/species\_en

#### Year 2100

#### Impacts of Climate Change on Growth Performance of Aquaculture Species

- Physiological-based cultivation model calibrated against specific farms (same model for all species / countries).
- Climate change 'winners' and 'losers' depending on location and species.
- Some shellfish farms do particularly poorly due to warming and reduced primary production projected for 2100 (much less change by 2050).
- Only direct and no indirect effects included here.

		rear		2100	
Country	Species	Harvest weight		Total Prod	
		RCP4.5	RCP8.5	RCP4.5	RCP8.5
Ireland	Salmon				
Norway	Salmon				
Turkey	Sea bass				
Spain	Sea				
	bream				
Poland	Carp				
Turkey	Rainbow				
	trout				
Denmark	Blue				
	mussels				
Netherlands	Blue				
	mussels				
Netherlands	Pacific				
	oysters				
Portugal	Med				
	mussels				

CERES Synthes

CERES Synthesis Report: Chapter 5

much lowersame average andrangesignificantly greater

significantly lower same average, wider range much greater

lower average ≥ present day

≤ present day Higher average

#### **Indirect Effects of Climate Change**

- Examples: Disease, HABs, Jellyfish.
- Focus on disease –global significance & major stakeholder concern.
- Tools developed to study impacts under present day and future climate scenarios.
- >20 diseases, across 6 host species and 10 countries investigated.
- Other EU and national programs creating short-term (1- to 2-wk) forecasts for HABs. More work needed on jellyfish.

**CERES Synthesis Report: Chapter 5** 



- Projection of change in suitable days for specific diseases
- Shown is example for Spring Viraemia of carp in Poland (RCP8.5, 2050)

CERES Synthesis Report: Chapter 5





#### Economic Impacts on Aquaculture: Typical Farms

- Typical farm models constructed for species / regions and four scenarios tested: World Markets (WM), National Enterprise (NE), Global Sustainability (GS) and Local Stewardship (LS).
- Projections indicated sea bass, salmon and bestpractice trout farms were most profitable
- Substantial losses in profit projected for some farms of same / other species (trout and carp in ponds).
- Losses or gains often scenario-dependent. Results depend more on future social-economic trajectories than on direct effects of climate change.
- For example, fish price relatively low in more global (GS) compared to nationalistic scenarios (NE & LS). Innovation needed to control fishmeal / oil prices.



#### **Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment**

- Ranked national vulnerability based on farmed species, methods, economic indicators, expert evaluation.
- climate-driven warming (RCP8.5, 2050) caused little reduction in habitat suitability based on species thermal growth performance.
- Small farms lacking environmental control (e.g. traditional trout, carp and shellfish farms) more vulnerable (low adaptive capacity by technological innovation).
- SE Europe vulnerable due to relative importance of aquaculture to GDP, smaller portfolio of species, and status of national climate adaptation plans.
- Measures increasing economic performance (e.g. vertical integration, RAS) will also reduce climate change vulnerability.

**CERES Synthesis Report: Chapter 5** 





#### **Stakeholder Mind-mapping: Turkish Trout Farms**





#### Most preferred mitigation measures

*Government:* (1) support cultivation of new species (2) pay compensation (3) help designate more production sites

Technology: (1) use recirculation systems (2) use technology to reduce some CC impacts

#### **CERES Synthesis Report: Chapter 5**

(mind-mapping conducted in all 24 Storylines)



#### **CERES Synthesis Report: Chapter 2**

# Biological forecasting Hungarian pond aquaculture

- Higher change in yield at lower stocking density
- Increased evaporation, more supplementary water will be needed
- Increasing occurrence of suboptimal oxygen levels







### The prospects of the industry: modelled & non-modelled forecasts







# Adaptation measures identified

- Monitoring (real time diagnostics)
- Develop infrastructures to withstand floods
- Use of aerators, oxygen manipulation
- Adequate stocking rate and biomass management

#### Industry-level

- More detail in official statistics
- Breeding programmes
- Monitoring and mapping disease outbreaks
- Preventive treatments and vaccines

Governance

# Research & knowledge building



Hungarian pond aquaculture





# Aquaculture: Questions?





Lake fishery: Relative change by 2050 with present day fishing pressure






# Decline in whitefish in South and Central Europe

- Despite potential for increased growth and production
- Predation by invading species- e.g. pike-perch is a threat
- Reduced reproduction due to increase in predation, siltation, oxygen deficit, too high incubation temperatures.



# In Czech whitefish **lost 90%** of original distribution

This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation action under grant agreement no. 677039





# Consequences for the good ecological status (GES)

- Salmonid fish are considered the indicators of GES everywhere
- Expect decline in ES in southern and central Europe
- Slowing or reversing this trend requires huge effort
- Protect, prevent invasive species, conduct (semi)artificial reproduction







# Consequences for the good ecological status (GES)

- Cyprinid fish are considered the indicators of degraded Ecological state
- Many will competitively benefit from warming
- ES is very likely to decline





This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation action under grant agreement no. 677039



# Shared Impacts CC on Freshwater Operations

Italian Lake Garda – Hungarian Ponds









# Stretch your legs!

# Marine fisheries next

### Marine Fishery Relative change by 2050 under RCP4.5. with present day fishing pressure





# Shared Impacts CC across marine Fisheries:

North Atlantic pelagic, WoS demersal





This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation action under grant agreement no. 677039



**Attribution - Importance of Biological Time Series** 

- Time series analyses (11 applications) of single or multiple species within 8 European regions.
- Historical changes in stocks mainly driven by fishing but climate variability has triggered (amplified or weakened) observed responses.
- Capacity to build reliable projection models requires robust (long, continuous, data-rich) time series for the main European Seas and inland waters. Such time series are scarce and in only a few areas.
- Healthy stocks will display less climate-driven variation (until physiological thresholds are passed) underscoring importance of sustainable, ecosystem-based management for climate adaptation







### Projected Climate Change Effects on Marine Fishery Targets

- Applied 12 state-of-the-art biological projection models (often 2 models per region).
- Projections of shift are consistent across different types of models – shown is % change by 2050
- Markedly stronger effects of RCP8.5 (right) compared to RPC4.5 (left)
- Winners and losers (e.g. also when comparing stocks of same species)
- Models projected change for species currently in region – future, novel species not considered





### **Economic Impacts on Fleets**

- Profitability at 2050 tested under four scenarios (consistent narratives of environmental, economic, legal, technological and political change)
- Changes in policy (e.g. access) and economics (fuel / fish price) more important than direct, biological effects of climate change.
- Shifts in profitability between fleet segments projected in Norwegian / Barents Sea.



Regions	Pelagic Fleets				Demersal Fleets			
	WM	NE	GS	LS	WM	NE	GS	LS
Norwegian and Barents Sea*								
Baltic Sea						+/-		
North Sea/ North East Atlantic	+/-	++/		++/				
Western Mediterranean Sea								
Aegean Sea						+/-		
Most negative	No effect						Most positive	No data



### **Climate Change Risk Analysis**

- Regions in SE Europe and UK have highest risk to both fleets <u>and</u> communities (low GDP, few targeted species)
- In other regions, risk is greatest at fleet <u>or</u> community level but <u>considerable differences exist</u>, <u>even within a country</u>
- Smallest vessels (less than 6m) had much higher risk than other size classes (Mediterranean -Croatia, Bulgaria, France, Malta and Greece)
- In some regions (e.g. SE Baltic) increasing resilience needed (e.g. creating alternative employment opportunities in community)
- In regions where fleet risks dominate, prioritize increasing fleet efficiency / diversity.





### Stakeholder Mind-mapping: Example for dolphinfish Western Mediterranean



#### Social & economic impacts



#### **Mitigation measures**





#### Stakeholder Mind-mapping: Tranformative Climate Change Adaptation



## General: outcomes and recommendations



This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation action under grant agreement no. 677039



# Key exploitable outcomes at case study level

- Identified knowledge gaps (published papers)
- Forecasting models for fish production
- Identified risks and opportunities
- Climate Adaptation Plans for fisheries and aquaculture
- The ClimeFish Decision Support Framework
- Decision Support Software





# Key exploitable outcomes at EU level



- E-learning course on "Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation in Fisheries and Aquaculture" at FAO learning Academy
- Guidelines for establishing legal good practice
- Recommendations for co-creation practices
- Guidelines for making Climate Adaptation plans for fisheries and aquaculture - European voluntary standard (CWA)
- Contribution to the EU Adaptation Strategy Package for fisheries and aquaculture





# **Guidelines for creating Climate Adaptation Plans (CAPs)**

**CEN Workshop Agreement** 

opean Committee for Standardization

CWA 17518:2020

Good practice recommendations for making Climate Adaptation Plans for fisheries and aquaculture



agreement no. 677039

# Adaptation Strategy Package for EU fisheries and aquaculture



Key elements:

- 1. Adaptation priorities
- 2. Regulation and policy framework
- 3. Funding
- 4. Available tools
- 5. Knowledge building
- 6. Adaptation strategies and action plans
- 7. Adaptation measures idenified
- 8. Evaluation and timeline for implementation

### Stakeholders that participated in the case study events







**6**NGOs

**5** Advisory bodies







**12** external scientists

**45** Climefish scientists







### **Recommendations for Future Research**

**1)** Integrating climate research across disciplines: It is inherently challenging to conduct inter-disciplinary science, foster training programs. Need to embed social scientists as facilitators of stakeholder engagement. Perceived N-S gradient in European emphasis.

2) Conducting trans-disciplinary climate change science: Barriers to cooperation between climate scientists and industry (aquaculture and fisheries) are disappearing. Calls needed that focus on artisanal fishers and farmers.



Pelagic Freeze-trawler Association freezer-trawler companies

Association of 9 European pelagic Association of producer organizations in Dutch Demersal Fisheries

Large ponds: carp, whitefish, pikeperch

Consultancy for aquaculture companies, risk assessment

Veterinary practice & consultancy for aquaculture companies

Interface between industry, education and scientific research

Large aquaculture facilities: trout, seabass, seabream, meagre



### **Recommendations for Future Research**

3) Capturing uncertainty in physical & biological projections: Multiple RCPs (scenarios), multiple GCMs downscaled to regional hydrodynamic models, multiple biological models...



(2050 - 1985)

### **Recommendations for Future Research**



**4)** Spatial and temporal resolution of physical impacts: Move from regional climate change (sub-basin scales). Need projections with higher spatial resolution... local scale



NASO Maps Greece https://www.google.com/maps/d/viewer...







# CERES

### **Recommendations for Future Research**

**5)** Direct biological effects of climate change on aquatic living resources: Gap analysis identified research needs on interacting factors and life stage responses.

6) Indirect biological effects of climate change need to be better represented in models such as (novel) food webs or future prevalence of disease.





# CERES

### **Recommendations for Future Research**

7) More effort on producing bioeconomic scenarios for mid- to late-century: For both sectors, future changes in policy or economics often more important than direct, biological effects of climate change (e.g. scenarios considered now would differ because of Covid-19).



# CERES

### **Recommendations for Future Research**

8) Climate change vulnerability / risk: better represent sensitivity and adaptive capacity of dependent human communities (bottom-up approach) – social-ecological systems.



Spreading our Message	#
Radio or TV	11
Exhibition	16
Flyers	6
Peer-reviewed publications	50
Publications (in prep)	19
Popularised publications	10
Project Deliverable Reports	16
CERES Conferences	6
CERES Workshops	38
Activity w/ H2020 project(s)	8
Conferences Attended	142
Workshops Attended	54
Press releases	13
Social media	10
Training	14
Video/film	8
Apps	4





Climate Change and European Fisheries and Aquaculture



**CERES Synthesis Report** 

CERES Project Synthesis Report



#### **CERES in 2020 Report**

ceresproject.eu



WATER: Where can Aquaculture Thrive in EuRope Use WATER to map depth, wave height, oxygen, and other parameters in regional

seas. You can also use it to find out how well a particular species will grow in marine waters.

MET Database

Get data on the cultivation thresholds of aquatic animals and plants on the Maritime and Environmental Thresholds for Aquaculture database



### ClimeFish home page: https://climefish.eu/



Home The Project - 2020 Forum News - Results - Stakeholders -



- When: 25-26 February 2020
- Where: FAO Headquarters, Rome
- What: Programme



#### @ClimeFish, 1500+ followers

### Virtual fact sheets



#### Strong internal and external collaboration in both projects



#### CERES Consortium and Research Advisory / Reference User Groups



University)

## Thank you for your work and support!



More productivity metrics (8 babies – 6 shown)





... and likely a few more "in prep"

## **15+ ClimeFish Babies**

Hanne – Bjørk and August

Andrea – Erica

Rosa – Martinio

Gergõ – Anna and Marcel

David – Lada

Anne – Helena Jane

Scott – Emery

Juliana – Aurora

Unn – Jonas

Ragga – Arndis Anna and Edda Margrét

Szilivia – Ariana

Charlie – Freja





This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation action under grant agreement no. 677039



# General thoughts and advice after four years

- Good to run two projects in parallel. Request cooperative measures and budget in topic text and in DoA
- Request that Climate-ADAPT and other established platforms are used
- Encourage and support cooperation across Areas and Pillars in Horizon Europe
- Flexibility to move resources between WPs and Partners is essential when workforce moves or goes on parental leave
- Thanks to our very supportive and friendly Project officer and Policy Officer!





## Blue Action next